

Instructions

The team's task is to evaluate the different policy options described in the team's handout according to a number of evaluation criteria as depicted in the evaluation grid below.

- Use one evaluation grid per policy option.
- Evaluate the policy options as described on many criteria as possible on a scale from 1 (*“does not fulfil the criteria at all”*) to 5 (*“fulfils the criteria completely”*).
- You may not be able to rate every criteria from the description of the policy options given in the handout. However, try to use your best judgement as well as the team's combined experience in air pollution prevention and control policy making in your countries.
- Base the rating for *overall environmental effectiveness* (criteria 14) of the policy option on the ratings given to the first 13 criteria.
- Note that some of the policy options we have described may contain some less advantageous elements as well as positive elements. If you consider the “less advantageous elements” are not inherent to the policy instrument, try to give recommendations for improvement.
- Finally, for each policy option identify or provide examples of possible barriers and hurdles for effective implementation and enforcement in your region / country.

Policy Evaluation Grid

TEAM: _____ POLICY INSTRUMENT: _____	The policy instrument as described in the handout “does not fulfil the criteria at all (1)” ”fulfils the criteria completely (5)”					
	1	2	3	4	5	don't know
1 Enforceability The policy can be enforced with the available human and financial resources of the governmental regulator and/or other enforcement agents.						
Comments:						
2 Appropriateness The polluters have the human, knowledge-based and financial resources to implement the environmental policy.						
Comments:						
3 Predictability It is possible for those regulated, as well as others, to prepare and take into account the policy instrument and its implications, both in the short term and in the long term.						
Comments:						
4 Persistence The effects are persistent in such a way that they have a lasting effect on the state of the environment. The policy gives incentive for long-run improvements and technological change.						
Comments:						
5 Flexibility The policy instrument can easily be adapted to changing conditions.						
Comments:						
6 Economic efficiency The benefits to society are equal or almost equal to the costs imposed to society and polluters. (Both benefits and costs are valued in monetary terms.)						
Comments:						

TEAM: _____ POLICY INSTRUMENT: _____	The policy instrument as described in the handout “ <i>does not fulfil the criteria at all (1)</i> ” “ <i>fulfils the criteria completely (5)</i> ”					
	1	2	3	4	5	don't know
7 Cost-effectiveness Do the results justify the resources used? This is a cost-results criterion in which benefits are not valued in monetary terms. Could the same results have been achieved with fewer resources or could the same resources be used more effectively to achieve a better result?						
Comments:						
8 Administrative burden and costs to the government / EPA The implementation and enforcement of the policy requires only reasonably small human and financial resources from the government and its agencies. In addition distinguish between the required resources for monitoring and enforcement & sanctioning:						
..the policy requires limited resources for monitoring.						
..the policy requires limited resources for enforcement and sanctioning.						
Comments:						
9 Legitimacy Individuals and organizations, such as non-governmental organizations (NGOs), interest organizations and firms accept the environmental policy instrument to a high degree.						
Comments:						
10 Transparency Outputs and outcomes of the environmental policy instrument, as well as the processes used in the implementation are observable for outsiders with a high degree of transparency.						
Comments:						

TEAM: _____ POLICY INSTRUMENT: _____	The policy instrument as described in the handout " <i>does not fulfil the criteria at all (1)</i> " " <i>fulfils the criteria completely (5)</i> "					
	1	2	3	4	5	don't know
11 Equity The outcomes and costs of the environmental policy instrument are evenly distributed among different interest groups. All participants have equal opportunities to take part in and influence the processes used by the administration.						
Comments:						
TEAM: _____ POLICY INSTRUMENT: _____	The policy instrument as described in the handout " <i>does not fulfil the criteria at all (1)</i> " " <i>fulfils the criteria completely (5)</i> "					
	1	2	3	4	5	don't know
12 Time scale of policy implementation The policy can be implemented in a short-term period. > 10 years (rating 1).....< 6 month (rating 5)						
Comments:						
13 Time scale of policy effects The policy shows the intended effects in a short-term period. > 10 years (rating 1).....< 6 month (rating 5)						
Comments:						
14 Overall expected environmental effectiveness The achieved outcomes correspond to the intended goals of the policy instrument to a high degree.						
Comments:						

What are other barriers for implementation and enforcement of this specific policy instrument?	No barrier (1)major barrier (5)					
	1	2	3	4	5	don't know
• Lack of top-level governmental support						
• Lack of governmental financing						
• Overlap of governmental competencies at national level						
• Overlap of governmental competencies between national, state, and municipal level						
• Industry lobbyism						
• Public resistance						
• Corruption						
• Lack of skilled human resources						
• Lack of trust between different actors						
Other barriers in your country /region that make the effective implementation of this particular policy instrument more difficult:						